News Literacy
Future of Libraries
October 11, 2017

Carol Frost
Pacific Library Partnership

Emily Weak
Oakland Public Library

Adam Elsholz
South San Francisco Public Library
ELEMENTS OF NEWS LITERACY GRANT

• PLP Survey to understand news literacy needs in the Bay Area

• One regional meeting with public and academic librarians, academics, journalists and media partners (October 3)

• Create a News Literacy Working Group

• Develop a News Literacy Resource Toolkit for libraries

• New partnerships between libraries, media partners, academics and journalists
PEW: HOW PEOPLE APPROACH FACTS AND INFORMATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source: Survey conducted Sept. 29-Nov.6, 2016. “How People Approach Facts and Information” PEW RESEARCH CENTER</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Trust in news and information sources</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of U.S. adults who trust the following news and information source “a lot”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local public library or librarians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health care providers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family and friends</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local news organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government sources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National news organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial institutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social media such as Facebook, Twitter, Instagram (based on social media users)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean number information sources trusted “a lot” out of eight listed</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

Percentage is greater than all adults | Percentage is about the same as all adults | Percentage is less than all adults
PEW: HOW PEOPLE APPROACH FACTS AND INFORMATION

Some are interested in getting training

% of U.S. adult who say getting _____ would help them in making decisions ...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Training on how to use online resources to find trustworthy information</th>
<th>A lot</th>
<th>Somewhat</th>
<th>Not too much</th>
<th>Not at all</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>31%</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>24</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Training that would help you be more confident in using computers, smartphones and the internet |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------|----------|--------------|-----------|
| 28                                                                                    | 26    | 17       | 28           |           |

Source: Survey conducted Sept. 29-Nov. 6, 2016.
“How People Approach Facts and Information”

PEW RESEARCH CENTER

PLP NEWS LITERACY SURVEY

99% feel that it is “very or somewhat” important to help patrons develop news literacy skills.

50% feel “somewhat well equipped” to provide news literacy support.

32% have developed or are developing in-person workshops about news literacy.
FAKE NEWS

with your friend and colleague, Emily Weak

eweak@oaklandlibrary.org
oaklandlibrary.org/FakeNewsMaterials
Four workshops,
One staff training
This has been...

**FAKE NEWS**

with your friend and colleague, Emily Weak

eweak@oaklandlibrary.org

oaklandlibrary.org/FakeNewsMaterials
True vs fake news

HOW TO TELL THE DIFFERENCE

ADAM ELSHOLZ, SOUTH SAN FRANCISCO PUBLIC LIBRARY
Where does chocolate milk come from?
What is “fake news”?
Types of misleading and false news

1. Fake news
2. Misleading news
3. Highly partisan news
4. Clickbait
5. Satire
Other types of misinformation

1. Conspiracy Theories
2. Junk Science
3. State media - propaganda
Fake news

The Burrard Street Journal

NATIONAL REPORT

Media you can trust
Misleading news

A FIELD GUIDE TO LIES

Critical Thinking in the Information Age
DANIEL J. LEVITIN

An absurdly misleading/alarmist headline, because stoking panics in exchange for retweets is always worth it

Michael Tracey
@mtracey

Congress, investigate Seth Rich Murder! @JulianAssange made comments u need to listen to! If Seth was wiki source, no Trump/Russia collusion

Sean Hannity
@seanhannity

Excellent and comprehensive reporting of FACTS. #SethRich twitter.com/cassandraru...
Highly partisan news

Sealed indictments out of Eastern District of Virginia under Dana Boente. Trump, Manafort and Flynn among others under sealed indictment.

The Heartland Institute has mailed books and DVDs claiming there is no scientific consensus on climate change to more than 300,000 teachers.

Now four senators are warning that it's false information.

Here's what would be considered a pre-existing condition under the GOP plan:
→ Domestic violence
→ Sexual assault
→ C-section

#VoteNoAHCA

Donald Trump is going down for Russian money laundering, and now there's nothing he can do to stop it.

Factchecker: The bogus claim that a map of crosshairs by Sarah Palin's PAC incited Rep. Gabby Giffords's shooting

Their answer: No. Good to read this from a conservative source like @DailyCaller.
Clickbait

9 Out Of 10 Americans Are Completely Wrong About This Mind-Blowing Fact
(wealth distribution)

Some Strange Things Are Happening To Astronauts Returning To Earth
(perspective gained from looking back at Earth)
Satire

Bodybuilder Can’t Believe He Forgot To Develop Right Arm
Pranks

**Hillary Clinton Found Dead?**
A distasteful prank article spreads misinformation about the former Secretary of State.

On 29 May 2017, a website called “Fresh News” posted a page with the headline “BREAKING: Hillary Clinton Found Dead”
Conspiracy Theories

Fact Check

Clinton Body Bags
Decades-old political rumor claims Bill Clinton quietly did away with several dozen people who possessed incriminating evidence about him.

Twitter:

Jason Ross
@jasonross
Anthony Weiner is living proof the Clintons don't murder people.
9:26 AM - 19 May 2017
Who makes “fake news”?
There are 30 websites in 6 languages that enable anyone to create & spread their own fake news story on Facebook:

Create-Your-Own-Fake-News Sites Are Booming On Facebook And Victim...
At least 30 websites invite people to make up a fake news story and share it on Facebook. Over the past 12 months the articles have generated more than 13 mil...

buzzfeed.com
Coca-Cola Recalls Dasani Water After Clear Parasite Worm Was Found In Bottles Across U.S.
How Russian Propaganda Spread From a Parody Website to Fox News

By NEIL MacFARQUHAR and ANDREW ROSSBACK  JUNE 7, 2017

Parody website → Facebook → Russian TV → The Sun → FoxNews.com

Made up Russian attack on U.S. ship → Invented a quote from a U.S. Air Force general → Reprinted article with only hints of skepticism
Total Facebook Engagements for Top 20 Election Stories

- **Mainstream News**
  - Feb.–April: 12 million
  - May–July: 9 million
  - Aug.–Election Day: 8.7 million

- **Fake News**
  - Feb.–April: 3 million
  - May–July: 7.3 million

Engagement refers to the total number of shares, reactions, and comments for a piece of content on Facebook. Source: Facebook data via Buzzsumo.
Impacts of Fake News

Conspiracy Theorist Alex Jones Apologizes For Promoting ‘Pizzagate’

March 26, 2017 · 4:49 AM ET
WE PETITION THE OBAMA ADMINISTRATION TO:

Alaska back to Russia.

Groups Siberian russians crossed the Isthmus (now the Bering Strait) 16-10 thousand years ago.

Julian Assange special: Do WikiLeaks have the email that will put Hillary Clinton in prison? (E376)

Published time: 6 Aug, 2016 10:45
Edited time: 8 Aug, 2016 08:41

Vast majority of media coverage on Trump’s first month in office ‘hostile’ – study

Published time: 3 Mar, 2017 03:49

‘If you’re MSM and telling lies, we’re watching you’ – investigative group on CNN sting videos

Published time: 29 Jun, 2017 09:47
Edited time: 29 Jun, 2017 09:50
Solutions

Fact checking websites and lists
Internet company policies
Nutritional label for information
Government agency
Education
New policies
Technology solutions

Google search results for "dasani water bottle recall parasite"

About 11,900 results (0.60 seconds)

Dasani Products Recalled Due to 'Clear Parasite'? - Snopes.com
www.snopes.com/dasani-recalled-clear-parasite/

Claim: Coca-Cola issued a recall of Dasani water products after a clear parasite was found in bottles across the United States.

Fact check by Snopes.com: FALSE

Feedback
Technology solutions

- It goes against my views
  Examples: makes fun of my personal values, religion or politics

- It advocates violence or harm to a person or animal
  Examples: graphic injury, terrorism, or animal abuse

- It's a false news story
  Examples: purposefully fake or deceitful news, a hoax disproved by a reputable source

- See more options
So who decides if news is fake? Suckinberg? No thanks. If I can't tell if something is fake or not it's my fault for being an idiot.
Technology solutions

Fake News Alert
offered by Brian Feldman

OpenSources
Professionally curated lists of online sources, available free for public use.

B.S. Detector
A browser extension that alerts users to unreliable news sources.
He also cautions anyone pondering the hard-to-define problem of fake news to think more broadly about it. "Almost all the attention goes to the supply of fake news. How to reduce it, identify it, choke it off, label it," says Rosen. "There is almost no interest in the demand for fake news."

Algorithms will be helpful, but real progress on understanding or controlling the fake news phenomenon is ultimately about humans not machines.
Nutritional label?
Know before you share

1. Be aware of your own biases
2. Use fact-checking websites
3. Check the publication title
4. Investigate the website address, or URL
5. Check for an author or reporter – is there one?
6. Home page aesthetics
7. Read the About Us page
8. Writing style and quality
9. Are there “clickbait” headlines?
10. Look for primary sources
11. Identify the source of the information
12. Check for additional sources
13. Trace the quote, especially if in a meme
14. Go to the original source – if you can find it
15. Check a list of unreliable websites
16. Accountability in way of corrections, retractions, dismissals

Sources: CNN, Dr. Melissa Zemdars, FactCheck.org, New York Times
Look for these clues

1. Authorship – name and bio
2. Publication - “About Us” page, contact information
3. Sources, quality and quantity
4. Writing style and quality
5. “clickbait” headlines
6. Accountability in way of corrections, retractions, dismissals
In other words...

1. Who wrote it?
2. Who published it?
3. Who is telling the story?
Cognitive Bias

Your own  Media
Others you know  Politicians
Employees  Internet Companies
Your social media account  State media
Conspiracy Theorists  Establishment / Deep state
Spicer on 'covfefe' tweet: "The president and a small group of people know exactly what he meant."

David Mack
@davidmackau

Holy crap. This exchange between Chris Wallace and Trump's lawyer is absolutely incredible.
Fact-Checking Organizations
FULL LIST OF FAKE NEWS OUTLETS
- The New York Times
- The Washington Post
- CNN
- NBC News
- MSNBC
- CBS News
- ABC News
- Salon.com
- The Huffington Post
- Rolling Stone
- BBC News
- Sky News
- Financial Times
- Politico
- New York Daily News
- L.A. Times

Snopes Fact Checker Accused Of Fraud For Prostitute Embezzlement Scheme

Alex Jones
@RealAlexJones

.@POTUS is the target of coup d'état being undertaken by the Deep State & government-controlled MSM - infowars.com/deep-state-mai ... #usa

Mainstream Media IS Fake News!
Dec 9, 2016

Donald J. Trump
@realDonaldTrump

I heard poorly rated @Morning_Joe speaks badly of me (don't watch anymore). Then how come low I.Q. Crazy Mika, along with Psycho Joe, came...

5:52 AM - 29 Jun 2017

Donald J. Trump
@realDonaldTrump

...to Mar-a-Lago 3 nights in a row around New Year's Eve, and insisted on joining me. She was bleeding badly from a face-lift. I said no!

5:58 AM - 29 Jun 2017
Investigate the website address, or URL

abcnews.com.co

Website title  domain
In February, the president was spotted with a printed copy of a GotNews article in the Oval Office. The article, which claimed to pinpoint a source of leaks from within the West Wing, was shown to him by his wife, according to one person with knowledge of the encounter — first reported by Politico — who did not know how the first lady had come across it.

Not only do we know President Donald Trump reads GotNews—we now know his wife, First Lady Melania Trump, may have first put the award-winning news site on his radar. In May, the blog Politico editorialized that someone
About The Onion

The Onion is the world’s leading news publication, offering highly acclaimed, universally revered coverage of breaking national, international, and local news events. Rising from its humble beginnings as a print newspaper in 1765, The Onion now enjoys a daily readership of 4.3 trillion and has grown into the single most powerful and influential organization in human history.

In addition to maintaining a towering standard of excellence to which the rest of the industry aspires, The Onion supports more than 350,000 full- and part-time journalism jobs in its numerous news bureaus and manual labor camps stationed around the world, and members of its editorial board have served with distinction in an advisory capacity for such nations as China, Syria, Somalia, and the former Soviet Union. On top of its journalistic pursuits, The Onion also owns and operates the majority of the world’s transoceanic shipping lanes, stands on the nation’s leading edge on matters of deforestation and strip mining, and proudly conducts tests on millions of animals daily.
Source Analysis

Quoted sources
Primary sources
Anonymous or official statements
Other media outlets

“If I were to run, I’d run as a Republican. They’re the dumbest group of voters in the country. They believe anything on Fox News. I could lie and they’d still eat it up. I bet my numbers would be terrific.”

Donald Trump
People Magazine, 1998
Accountability

- Editorial guidelines
- Ownership
- Funding sources
- Ombudsperson
- Corrections Policy and Practices
- Mission statement
- Ethics code
- Conflicts of interest disclosure

3 CNN staffers resign over retracted Scaramucci-Russia story

By Hadas Gold | 06/26/2017 06:46 PM EDT | Updated 06/27/2017 09:25 PM EDT

Three CNN staffers have resigned following the publication and subsequent retraction of a story linking a Trump transition team member to the Russia-related investigations.

Correction: February 23, 1997, Sunday An article on page 34 of The Times Magazine today, about people who dislike President Clinton and suspect that he is guilty of or has knowledge of various crimes, misstates the age of Hugh H. Sprunt, who published a report about the death of Vincent Foster. He is 47, not 57. The article also refers incorrectly to Mr. Sprunt’s career right after he attended Stanford. He worked for the National Ocean Survey, a branch of the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration, and was not in the Navy.
Conspiracy Theories

AND HOW THEY SPREAD ON THE INTERNET
Six Characteristics of Conspiracy Theories

- Unanswered questions
- Nothing as it appears
- Everything is evil
- Everything is under control
- Anomaly hunting
- Irrefutable

Suspicious Minds: Why We Believe Conspiracy Theories
Book by Rob Brotherton
Who are conspiracy theorists?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Paranoia</th>
<th>Connecting dots</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Enlightenment ideals</td>
<td>Intention detector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intellectual autonomy</td>
<td>Magnitude matching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultic milieu</td>
<td>Confirmation bias</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contemporary theories – The Clintons

- “Vast right-wing conspiracy”
- Hillary’s health
- Benghazi
- Clinton Body Count
- New World Order
Brown Cows?

7% of surveyed Americans think chocolate milk comes from brown cows.

UndeniablyDairy.org
Brown Cows?

Where do brown cows come from?

A. Brown cows
B. Black and white cows
C. I don’t know
True, Fake or Conspiracy Theory: A Game Show

Clues:
Author bio
Publication About Us
Source(s)